



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR
Alameda County

ADRIENNE J. TISSIER, VICE CHAIR
San Mateo County

TOM AZUMBRADO
*U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development*

TOM BATES
Cities of Alameda County

DEAN J. CHU
Cities of Santa Clara County

DAVE CORTESE
Association of Bay Area Governments

CHRIS DALY
City and County of San Francisco

BILL DODD
Napa County and Cities

DORENE M. GIACOPINI
U.S. Department of Transportation

FEDERAL D. GLOVER
Contra Costa County

ANNE W. HALSTED
*San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission*

STEVE KINSEY
Marin County and Cities

SUE LEMPERT
Cities of San Mateo County

JAKE MACKENZIE
Sonoma County and Cities

JON RUBIN
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

BIJAN SARTIPI
*State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency*

JAMES P. SPERING
Solano County and Cities

AMY REIN WORTH
Cities of Contra Costa County

KEN YEAGER
Santa Clara County

STEVE HEMINGER
Executive Director

ANDREW B. FREMIER
Deputy Executive Director

BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY (BATA)
OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
January 13, 2010
MINUTES

Attendance

BATA Oversight Committee Chair Bill Dodd, convened the meeting at 9:41 a.m. In addition to Chair Dodd, the following Committee members were in attendance: Tom Bates, Federal Glover, Steve Kinsey, and Vice Chair Chris Daly.

Other Commissioners in attendance: Dean Chu, Dorene Giacopini, Scott Haggerty, Ann Halsted, Sue Lempert, Jake Mackenzie, Jon Rubin, Jim Spring, Adrienne Tissier, and Amy Rein Worth.

Consent Calendar

Three (3) items were unanimously received and approved on the Consent Calendar:

- Minutes of the December 9, 2009 meeting
- BATA Financial Statements – November 2009
- Contract Amendment – Advanced Toll Collection and Accounting System (ATCAS) Toll Plaza Server Room and Facility Improvements: Aztec Consultants, Inc.

Construction of San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge (SFOBB) Toll Operations Building: Roebblelen Contracting, Inc.

Mr. Stephen Wolf, BATA staff requested the Committee to authorize the Executive Director to negotiate and enter into a Contract with Roebbelen Contracting, Inc. for construction of the SFOBB Toll Operations Building in an amount not to exceed \$13,787,028 and to authorize a contingency fund in the amount of \$3,700,000. In response to Committee member questions, Cynthia Segal, of BATA's Office of Counsel, stated that contract protest process consists of a staff review and, a response by the Executive Director, based on the staff review. If the protestor appeals the Executive Directors decision, there would be a review by the BATA Oversight Committee of any protest submitted. The Committee unanimously approved the staff recommendation.

Public comment was received from Ken Wenham, Roebbelen Contracting, Inc., and Bob Allen, Alten Construction.

I-680 Express lane Operations

Ms. Beth Zelinski, BATA staff, requested that the Committee authorize the Executive Director, to negotiate and enter into a Cooperative Agreement with the Sunol Smart Carpool Lane JPA for the BATA FasTrak[®] CSC to support the I-680 Express Lane and a contract change order with ACS for the FasTrak[®] CSC to support the Express Lane in an amount not to exceed \$1,939,780. The I-680 Express Lane is expected to be in operation in Summer 2010. The Committee unanimously approved the staff recommendation.

Toll Bridge Program Capital and Operating Budget Revisions (BATA Resolution No. 86, Revised)

Mr. Peter Lee, BATA staff, requested the Committee to refer BATA Resolution No. 86, revised to the Authority for approval for the following actions:

- Allocate \$144 million in toll funds for the Yerba Buena Island Transition Structures #1 Contract.
- Program \$750 million in toll funds for the Antioch Bridge and Dumbarton Bridge Seismic Retrofit Projects into the Toll Bridge Seismic Retrofit Program, subject to adoption of the proposed increase in toll on the state-owned bridges, and re-allocate \$43 million in prior allocations of Toll Bridge Rehabilitation Program funds for the Antioch and Dumbarton Bridge seismic retrofit projects to the TBSRP
- Approve release of bid documents for the Antioch Bridge Seismic Retrofit and authorize the BATA Executive Director to approve any future contract addenda for the project.
- Increase the transfer budget by \$1,683,000 to accommodate the balance of the authorized transit capital transfers.

The Committee unanimously approved the staff recommendation.

Mr. Jerry Grace asked about safety issues regarding the “S” curve on the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge.

Toll Schedule Increase for the State-owned Toll Bridge in the Bay Area, BATA Resolution No. 90.

Mr. Steve Heminger, BATA Executive Director, presented staff’s recommendation in regards to a toll increase for the state-owned bridges in the Bay Area. A toll increase on the bridges is needed to fund the seismic retrofit of the Antioch and Dumbarton Bridges, to off-set reduced revenues due to declining traffic volumes on the bridges, and to fund increased costs of our debt financings. Staff estimates that approximately \$160 million in new annual revenues is needed. Current toll funds pay for the Regional Measure 1 Program, which funds a number of voter approved bridge improvement projects, Regional Measure 2, which funds voter approved transportation throughout the region and the Seismic Retrofit, which includes the seismic improvements of the region’s bridges including the new East Span of the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge. Based on a recent analysis conducted by Caltrans, it was found that the Antioch and Dumbarton Bridges were in need of seismic retrofit. Although these two bridges were built within the past 40 years, seismic standards and knowledge have substantially evolved over that

time. The retrofit design for both bridges has been completed and the cost estimate for the retrofits of both bridges totals \$750 million.

Staff had earlier presented three toll increase options for discussion. To obtain public comment on the options, public hearings were held in Oakland, San Mateo, Concord and San Francisco. To date, a total of about 1,700 comments and survey responses from the public have been received. Based on the Committee discussion and public testimony, staff developed a recommendation for a toll increase, as follows:

Vehicle Class	Bridges	Toll Formula	Proposed Toll
2-axle Vehicles	Antioch, Benicia, Carquinez, Dumbarton, Richmond and San Mateo Bridges	NA	\$5.00 (base toll)
	San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge	NA	Peak - \$6.00 Non-Peak - \$4.00 Weekends - \$5.00
Vehicle Class	Bridges	Toll Formula	Proposed Toll
Carpools	All Bridges	50 percent of 2-axle base toll (\$5.00) rate	\$2.50
Trucks (multi-axle vehicles)	All Bridges	2-axle base toll (\$5.00) rate times number of axles.	3-axle - \$15.00 4-axle - \$20.00 5-axle - \$25.00 6-axle - \$30.00 7+-axle - \$35.00

Staff further recommended:

1. That the toll rate increases for 2-axle vehicles, including congestion pricing on the Bay Bridge, and carpools is effective on July 1, 2010.
2. That trucks are provided a one year grace period from the proposed toll increase. As a result, the toll increase for trucks would be effective on July 1, 2011.
3. That an evaluation of congestion pricing for the Bay Bridge be conducted and provided to the BATA Oversight Committee on an annual basis after congestion pricing is implemented.

In response to a number of questions and comments from Committee members, Mr. Heminger stated:

- Carpools are about 9 percent of total traffic on the bridges. Almost half of all carpools are on the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge.

- Under the proposed toll increase, the average truck (multi-axle vehicle) toll would be about \$30. Also, the current average truck (multi-axle vehicle) toll on the bridges is about \$11. Since the last three toll increases have been \$1 surcharges, the toll for trucks has not grown at nearly the same rates as for autos.
- Based on staff's assessment, BATA only has the authority to increase tolls for seismic retrofit of the bridges and other existing commitments. A bicycle lane on the West Span of the Bay Bridge is not an existing commitment. BATA in conjunction with Caltrans is currently conducting a Project Initiation Document, which is developing the scope and cost for a west span bicycle lane.
- Additionally, staff will investigate and report back to the full Authority whether the toll charged to carpools can qualify as a pre-tax employer paid or employee paid benefit.

Eight members of the public provided testimony in regards to the potential toll increase for the state-owned bridges, summarized as follows:

- Bob Lundin, Holiday Ramble Family Motor Coach, raised concerns about the toll increase for multi-axle vehicles.
- Eric Sauer, California Trucking Association, Bob Ramorino, Roadstar Trucking, Jeff Becker, Bay Counties Dump Truck Association, John Yandell, Yandell Truckaway Inc., raised concerns about the toll increase for trucks and requested that consideration be given to lengthening the time that the toll increase is deferred for multi-axle vehicles.
- Robert Raburn, East Bay Bicycle Coalition; Jason Meggs, Bicycle-Friendly Berkeley Coalition, and Andrew Casteel, Bay Area Bicycle Coalition, expressed support for consideration of a higher toll increase to fund bike access on the West Span of the Bay Bridge.

Following additional Committee discussion, Commissioner Kinsey moved and Commissioner Tissier seconded a motion to revise the toll schedule as presented by staff, with the exception that tolls for multi-axles vehicles would be deferred for one year (July 2010 through June 2011) and at 50 percent of the total increase in the second year (July 2011 through June 2012), with full implementation in the third year, and to direct staff to provide annual assessments of the impacts of congestion pricing and carpool charges to the BATA Oversight Committee. Commissioner Bates moved and Commissioner Daly seconded a substitute motion to amend the toll schedule, as presented by staff, with the exception that tolls for multi-axles vehicles would be deferred for one year and at 50 percent of the total increase in the second year and that the toll for carpools would be \$2.00, rather than \$2.50. The substitute motion failed: 2 Yes and 5 No.

The original motion then passed: 6 Yes and 1 No.

Regional Measure 1 (RM 1) and Seismic Retrofit Project (SRP) Monthly Progress Report

The RM 1 and SRP Monthly Report was provided to the Committee for information purposes.

Other Business/Public Comment/Next Meeting/Adjournment

There being no further business or public comment, the meeting was adjourned at 11:33 a.m.